

**MINUTES
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 20, 2007, 9:00 A.M.**

Board Members Present at Roll Call: Les Abrams, Gabe Corral, Charlie Havranek, Cynthia Henry, Debbie Rudd. A quorum was present. Board Members Present after Roll Call: Rod Bolden. Board Members Absent: Myra Jefferson. Vacant Board Member Positions: Public; Certified Residential Appraiser.

Also Present at Roll Call: Debb Pearson, Executive Director; Beckie Loar, Regulatory Compliance Administrator; Nancy Beck, Assistant Attorney General; Daniel Christl, Assistant Attorney General; Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office. Also Present after Roll Call: Blair Driggs, Assistant Attorney General.

Les Abrams acted as Chairperson.

The Board pledged allegiance to the flag of the United States of America.

Charles Havranek moved that the Minutes of the August 16, 2007, Regular Board Meeting be approved. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CALL TO PUBLIC

Polly Leeper Stidham filed a Call to Public and spoke to the Board concerning fingerprint results.

RECOGNITION AND RECEIPTION FOR RETIRED BOARD MEMBER, SARAH C. VETAULT

Tabled because Sarah Vetault could not be present.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Issues Dealing with Formal Hearing Concerning 2240, Anna M. Diaz.

Respondent did not appear, but was represented by David N. Ferren, Esq. Daniel Christl, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board deny the proposed settlement offer and reoffer Respondent the original Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline offered Respondent in 5/07. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion upon the following roll call vote: Les Abrams--yes; Gabe Corral--yes; Charlie Havranek--yes; Cynthia Henry--yes; Debbie Rudd--yes.

Rod Bolden joined the meeting.

Issues Dealing with Formal Hearing Concerning 07F-2321-BOA, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent appeared. Nancy Beck, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board deny Respondent's request for an informal hearing and proceed to the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2450, Michael A. Lindberg.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Issues Dealing with Formal Hearing Concerning 07F-2325-BOA, Mark L. Andrews.

Respondent appeared. Daniel Christl, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table the matter until later in the day to allow the parties to revise the proposed settlement offer. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board approve the proposed revised settlement offer. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

WORKSHOP ON OPEN MEETING LAW, EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS AND CONFLICTS

Nancy Beck, Assistant Attorney General, presented a workshop relating to the open meeting law, ex parte communications and conflicts.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2475, Scott M. Sillari.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table the matter to allow Respondent to provide additional information. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2422, Richard M. Luttrupp.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing violations. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2476, Aaron O. Thomas.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2356, Thomas A. Reeb.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigator's report. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2434, Thomas M. Kittelmann.

Respondent appeared and was represented by Mark L. Collins, Esq. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the complaint be referred to an investigator. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2367, Jay B. Clark.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board reoffer Respondent the nondisciplinary letter of concern. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2453, Jaime Topete.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the complaint be referred to an investigator. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2452/2457, Dana A. Miller.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that 2452 be referred to an investigator. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that 2457 be referred to an investigator. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2378, Michael Santana.

Respondent appeared. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigator's report. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2307, Razvan P. Silvas.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve Paul B. Johnson, Certified Residential Appraiser #20952, as Respondent's mentor pursuant to the 9/18/07 Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2433/2446/2447, Michelle L. Hanke.

Respondent appeared. Staff summaries were read. Charlie Havranek moved that the complaints be referred to an investigator. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2423, Jerry A. Raby.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2407, Jacob C. Smith.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Gabe Corral moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted 2-4 against the motion. Les Abrams, Charlie Havranek, Cynthia Henry and Debbie Rudd voted no. Debbie Rudd moved that the complaint be referred to an investigator. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-1 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2280/2281/2282/2283/2284/2285/2286/2287/2288/2289/2290/2291/2292/2293/2294/2295/2296/2297/2298/2299/2300/2301, Kym R. Gaudette.

Respondent and Arthur T. Gaudette, Certified General Appraiser # 30945, appeared, were sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the complaints be referred to a formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion upon the following roll call vote: Les Abrams--yes; Rod Bolden--yes; Gabe Corral--yes; Charlie Havranek--yes; Cynthia Henry--yes; Debbie Rudd--yes.

Review and Action Concerning 2435, Peter Crimando.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-1 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2416, Michael W. Huscroft/2417, Tamra L. Hoffman.

Respondents did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaints. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2421, Michelle T. Caraballo.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board refer the complaint to an investigator. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-1 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2424, Michael W. Jacobs.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board subpoena additional information. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2425, Michael T. Forsythe.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Nancy Beck, Assistant Attorney General, left the meeting. Blair Driggs, Assistant Attorney General, joined the meeting.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2302, Michael D. Schendel.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that, at the written request of Respondent, the Board continue the informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2352/2353, V. Wesley Wylie.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the nondisciplinary letter of concern which was signed late by Respondent. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2360, James E. Clevenger.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the nondisciplinary letter of concern which was signed late by Respondent. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 1782/1784 (03F-1782-BOA/04F-1784-BOA), Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board subpoena additional information. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board open complaint 2492 alleging noncompliance of the 3/21/07 Amended Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Order of Probation. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Cynthia Henry left the meeting. A quorum remained.

Review and Action Concerning 2091, Joseph E. Kaneakua.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board table the complaint to allow Respondent to provide the previously requested information and that staff request three files for audit. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2144, Marshall S. Coffman.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that because Respondent's 90-day grace period to renew had expired, the complaint be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2262/2444, Dawna Rogers.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read concerning 2444. Debbie Rudd moved that 2444 be referred to an investigator. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that, concerning 2262 the Board open complaint 2493 alleging noncompliance with the 3/8/07 nondisciplinary letter of remedial action. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Cynthia Henry rejoined the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2277, Eugene C. Rowe.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The motion was withdrawn. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board open complaint 2494 alleging noncompliance with the 7/18/07 Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2323, Stephanie L. Pepper.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the disciplinary education to comply with the 5/2/07 Consent Agreement and Order of Suspension and Discipline and that the complaint be closed. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2357, Michael A. Herrington.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Assistant Attorney General offer an amended nondisciplinary letter of concern citing the violations found in the investigative report. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2404, Brian D. Coup.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2419, Patricia L. Gerarde.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2224, Harrison Gordon/2225, Joshua Hernandez/2226, Nicolo Amoroso.

Respondent in 2224 appeared. Based on the 12-month file review, Debbie Rudd moved that the Board proceed with its investigation. Rod Bolden seconded the motion.

Review and Action Concerning Appellate Court Case 1CA-CV 05-0868 (98F-0544-BOA), Lawrence D. Bloom.

Respondent did not appear. There was no status update.

Review and Action Concerning Superior Court Case CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA), Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. There was no status update.

Review and Action Concerning 2247/2361, Alan A. Gilmore.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigator's reports. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2355/2371, Christine B. Fredericksen.

Respondent did not appear. Gabe Corral moved that because Respondent's 90-day grace period to renew had expired, the complaints be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2368, Delbert W. Mundy.

Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board accept the investigator's reports. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2311/2312/2313/2314/2315, Shahab A. Mehkri.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that, at the written request of Respondent, the Board continue the informal hearing. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Charlie Havranek moved that the Assistant Attorney General research whether the Board could delegate the continuance of informal hearings to staff. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2426, Ray F. Griego.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2427, Dan G. Karas.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing violations. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2339, Collin H. Lord.

Gabe Corral recused himself. Respondent did not appear. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level II violations and issue Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing the violations and requiring remedial education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2428/2429/2430, Douglas E. Grever.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board refer the complaints to an investigator. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Cynthia Henry left the meeting. A quorum remained.

Review and Action Concerning 2436, Vernon L. Stutzman.

Respondents did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board refer the complaint to an investigator. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2437, Peter C. Childs.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2438, Brian R. Haneline.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be tabled to allow Respondent's 90-day renewal grace period to expire. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2442/2443, John W. Marble III.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss 2443. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie

Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss 2442. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2445, Kevin J. Jaramillo.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2383, Richard T. Salceda.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Level II violations and issue Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2448, Hayden L. Meier.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board deny Respondent's request for an extension to complete the terms of the 5/31/06 Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board reopen the matter. Rod Bolden seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2451, Brooke Patterson.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2454, Tamara A. Tidwell.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2455, Jane A. Ritzenthaler.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2461, Matthew S. Prince.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. The motion was withdrawn. Debbie Rudd moved that the complaint be referred to an investigator.

The motion failed for the lack of a second. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted 4-1 in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2474, Jason R. Snyder.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern. The motion was withdrawn. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2481, Daniel W. Mahoney.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Charlie Havranek moved that the complaint be referred to an investigator. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

BOARD CHAIRPERSON REPORT

Les Abrams thanked the Education Committee for creating a Remedial and Disciplinary Education List and reported that progress continues to be made on the website renovations.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

Debb Pearson reported on the status of the Assistant Attorney General=s assignments; advised the complaint answer dates that had been extended by staff; reported the following complaint statistics for calendar years 2006 and 2007:

	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2007</u>
Complaints filed	209	182	
Complaints heard by Board			387
<u>OF THOSE COMPLAINTS:</u>			
Complaints dismissed	70	48	65
Complaints referred to investigation	84	37	83
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of concern	30	10	16
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of remedial action	10	4	9
Complaints resolved with disciplinary letter of due diligence	6	4	6
Complaints resolved with probation	25	10	31
Complaints referred to informal hearing	66	13	55
Complaints referred to formal hearing	10	3	8
Complaints resolved with suspension	6	2	3
Complaints resolved with surrender	1	0	1
Complaints resolved with revocation	1	3	4
Complaints resolved with cease and desist letters	24	0	2
Violation Levels:			
I	35	12	19
II	10	7	12

III	17	9	28
IV	3	2	4
V	9	3	4

Additional Information:

	<u>2005</u>	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>
Jurisdiction Expired & Complaints Closed	21	18	3
Denials of New Applications	5	7	5
Denials of Renewal Applications	2	4	0

reported that a Stakeholders/Rules Committee meeting had been scheduled for 10/5/07 and that a notice would be mailed to each stakeholder; reported on that the investigator contracts had been awarded; reported on the 8/29/07 Mortgage Fraud Task Force meeting; reported on the 8/13/07 adopted revised Appraisal Subcommittee Policy Statement 10: Enforcement; and distributed written legal advice at the request of Dawn Walton Lee, Assistant Attorney General.

APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

Debbie Rudd reported the following Arizona appraiser and property tax agent information as of August 14, 2007:

	<u>9/05</u>		<u>9/06</u>		<u>9/07</u>
Licensed Residential	871		1038		1136
Certified Residential	818		917		1040
Certified General	738		756		791
Nonresident Temporary	89	Total 2516	67	Total 2778	31
Property Tax Agents	283		307		262
					Total 2998

Charles Havranek moved that the Board adopt the procedure for handling fingerprint results that are rejected by the Department of Public Safety or the FBI. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board deny the Biennial Renewal Application for Certified Residential Certificate 20522, Kym R. Gaudette, pursuant to A.R.S. §§ 32-3620, 32-3631(A)(6), 32-3632(A)(7), 32-3631(A)(8), and 32-3631(A)(9). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Certified Residential Application #6836, Jennifer L. Morgan, substantively incomplete and request applicant to appear before the Committee to provide additional information. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board find Certified Residential Application #6924, Kevin J. Jaramillo, substantively complete. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Charlie Havranek moved that the Board notify Nonresident Temporary Certified General Certificate holder #TP41066, Scott A. McCorvie, and all states in which he is certified of his misrepresentation on his application. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE REPORT

Gabe Corral moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Charlie Havranek seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Gabe Corral left the meeting. A quorum did not remain.

Lester G. Abrams, Chairperson

**RECOMMENDATIONS
COMMITTEE ON APPLICATION REVIEW**

TO: Board of Appraisal

From: Application Review Committee

Date: September 20, 2007

Re: September 19, 2007 Recommendations

I. Report on number of Arizona Appraisers and Property Tax Agents:

	<u>9/05</u>		<u>9/06</u>		<u>9/07</u>
Licensed Residential	871		1038		1136
Certified Residential	818		917		1040
Certified General	738		756		791
Nonresident Temporary	89	Total 2516	67	Total 2778	31
Property Tax Agents	283		307		262

II. As a result of its September 19, 2007 meeting the Application Review Committee makes the following recommendations:

A. To refer to the full Board:

Handling of Fingerprint cards that are not accepted by DPS

B. To refer the following renewal application to the full Board:

20522 Kym R. Gaudette

C. To refer the following applications to the full Board:

6836 Jennifer L. Morgan
6924 Kevin J. Jaramillo

D. To refer the following Nonresident Temporary Certification already issued to the full Board:

TP41066 Scott A. McCorvie

E. To approve the following applications as substantively complete:

1. Licensed Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:

6792 Gregory C. Tobler
6808 James M. Plemons
6845 Stephen F. Mueller
6857 Elton E. Crowe
6858 Connie Renee Towery
6870 Shannon L. Veltkamp
6871 Mary K. Abker
6874 Renee A. Stanek (by reciprocity)
6877 Rose T. Amoako
6886 Jason A. Bastian
6887 Michael P. Pond
6901 Mary C. Hill
6905 Jamahl J. Jack
6933 Cole M. Gunderson
6934 Marc L. Derruisseaux
6944 Shane M. Handler

2. Certified Residential by exam unless otherwise noted:

6343 James J. Vodak
6407 Kathryn M. Christen
6544 Timothy R. Fortunato
6635 Wayne J. Tosczak
6745 Larry W. Shinn
6780 Daniel Wesley
6812 Craig A. Richardson
6816 Douglas L. Crinklaw, Jr.
6822 Karen E. Koby
6824 Mary H. Marks
6828 Elizabeth M. Peck
6832 Randall S. Lineberger
6835 Donald D. Thomas
6846 Anthony L. Pike
6873 Bob Huger
6880 Edward J. Stanton
6881 Alfred G. Froede (by reciprocity)
6885 Alison D. Martin
6889 Todd R. Havens
6892 Neil E Berens
6895 Aaron D. Still
6902 Ashley C. Campbell
6917 James A. Kerestes
6925 Lisa J. Headley
6926 Dale E. Anderson

6927 Stephanie M. Gauthier
6928 Jill S. Brandt
6930 Charles E. Decker
6932 Japheth A. Wentzel
6941 Mark W. Anderson
6946 Aaron M. West

3. Certified General by exam unless otherwise noted:

6807 Stephen R. Elston (by reciprocity)
6893 Joseph E. Creech (by reciprocity)
6896 Sean A. Chaffey
6912 Jeffrey P. Kauttu (by reciprocity)

D. To approve the following applications as substantively complete and confirm the issuance of the following license/certification:

1. Reciprocity

11894 John J. Vallejo
21600 David L. Beal
31558 Blair M. Giboney
31559 John A. Campbell
31561 Lorene M. Huffman
31562 William L. Corbin

E. To disapprove the following applications as substantively incomplete and hold until substantively complete:

6756 David C. DiPeso
6819 Ryan P. Graffius
6841 Larry R. Hamby
6862 Christina L. Scaturro
6864 Scott A. Wingo
6878 Amber D. Brooks
6891 Carolyn P. Holliday
6929 Rebecca B. Evans
6938 Brad M. Beggs (by reciprocity)
6948 Brandon J. Reich
6953 Daniel J. Kennedy

III. Applications Pending - Substantively Incomplete:

6489 Jose Magana
6562 Barbara J. Hallbourg

6570	Douglas Mitchell
6595	Rachel I. Encinas
6617	Brent A. Hodges
6681	George E. Shosted
6790	Mark W. Lewis (by reciprocity)
6829	Scott A. McCorvie (by reciprocity)
6861	Gena A. Cox-Dorman
6875	Polly L. Stidham (by reciprocity)

Notification of applicants with substantively incomplete applications who have not responded to the Committee's request for additional information. Pursuant to R4-46-202(D) applicants have up to a year to meet all requirements for license/certificate or applicant's file is to be closed by the Board and applicant shall reapply.

RECOMMENDATIONS

COMMITTEE ON APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION

TO: Board of Appraisal

FROM: Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education

DATE: September 20, 2007

RE: September 20, 2007 Recommendations

As a result of its September 20, 2007 meeting the Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education makes the following recommendations:

- I. Action regarding proposed approval of qualifying education courses:
 - A. Previously approved by the Board:
 1. Submitted by **American Society of Farm Managers & Rural Appraisers**
 - a. A-25 Eminent Domain, #ABA 0702-246 22 hours
*Paul Bierschwale, Virgil Holtgrewe, Mark A. Lewis, Jay Luse, Lee Smith
Recommend approval
 2. Submitted by **Arizona School of Real Estate & Business**
 - a. AP-01Z Real Property Valuation 101, #ABA 0901-025 36 hours
*Bob Artim, Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas P. Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Jared Huish, Robert Kaczmarek, Gretchen Koralewski, Don J. Miner, Roy E. Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Sanders Solot, Richard Turkian, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 - b. AP-02Z Real Property Valuation 102, #ABA 0901-026 40 hours
*Bob Artim, Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas P. Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Jared Huish, Robert Kaczmarek, Gretchen Koralewski, Don J. Miner, Roy E. Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Sanders Solot, Richard Turkian, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 3. Submitted by **Lincoln Graduate Center**
 - a. 772- 2006 National USPAP, #ABA 0602-235 15 hours
*Daniel Shoemaker, Larry Cole, Edmond Fisher, Michael Deal, Joe Huffman, Martin Molloy, Joseph Portera, David Shoemaker
Recommend approval

4. Submitted by **McKissock Appraisal School**
 - a. Residential Report Writing & Case Studies, #ABA 0906-573 15 hours
*Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
 - b. Residential Income Approach, #ABA 0906-574 15 hours
*Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by **Trans-American Institute of Professional Studies, Inc.**
 - a. Small Residential Income Property Appraisal, #ABA 0805-469 15 hours
*Lynne Heiden, Barry Shea, Ann Susko
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by **Appraisal Institute**
 - a. Online Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use, 15 hours
Distance Education
*Sara Schwarzentraub
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by **Arizona School of Real Estate & Business**
 - a. AP-11 General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, 30 hours
*Bob Artim, Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas P. Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Jared Huish, Robert Kaczmarek, Gretchen Koralewski, Don J. Miner, Roy E. Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Sanders Solot, Richard Turkian, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 - b. AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, 30 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Jared Huish, Gretchen Koralewski, Don J. Miner, Roy E. Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Sanders Solot, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 - c. AP-13 General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach, 30 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Jared Huish, Gretchen Koralewski, Don J. Miner, Roy E. Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Sanders Solot, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac, David Ziegler
Recommend approval

3. Submitted by **McKissock Appraisal School**
 - a. Appraisal Subject Matter Electives, 20 hours
Distance Education
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval
4. Submitted by **Trans-American Institute of Professional Studies, Inc.**
 - a. Residential Report Writing & Case Studies, 15 hours
*Lynne Heiden, Barry Shea, Ann Susko
Recommend approval

III. Action regarding proposed approval of continuing education courses:

A. Previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by **American Society of Farm Managers and Rural Appraisers**
 - a. All Toppo Maps-General Software Training, #ABA 1105-486 8 hours
*Mike Johnson
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by **Arizona School of Real Estate & Business**
 - a. 1072 Commercial Financing & Its Alternatives, #ABA 0906-577 3 hours
*William Brindley, William Epley, William Gray, Greg McGill, Don Miner, Ronald Shilling, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac
Recommend approval
 - b. 1145- How To Write a Commercial Lease, #ABA 0906-578 3 hours
*Jayme Bartholomew, Mike Denious, Billy Dowdy, Susan Dunst, Terry Foster, Bill Gray, Charles King, William Kozub, Mark Kramoltz, Greg McGill, Don Miner, Rick Turkian, Perry Williams
Recommend approval
 - c. 1213- Residential Remodeling, #ABA 0906-579 3 hours
*Clark Booth, Tom Denny, Clyde Dinnell, William Epley, Dave Maza, Paul Rhodes, Larry Schoenberger, Dan Smith
Recommend disapproval
 - d. 2738- Intro Real Estate Investing, #ABA 0906-580 3 hours
*Jim Adams, Earl Cass, Tony Cox, Neil Dauler-Phimney, William Epley, Gill Gray, Greg McGill, Dan Smith, Rick Turkian, Vick Gerard, Jeff Young, Terry Zajac
Recommend approval
3. Submitted by **The Columbia Institute**
 - a. FHA, the URAR & the 1025, No. 104, #ABA 0906-581 8 hours
*George Harrison, Marc Abood, Bernard Boarnet, Bobby Crisp, George Harrison, Dr. Samuel Harrison, Robert Hetrick, Diana Jacob, Howard Johnson, Amelia Lovorn-Brown, Martin Molloy, Roy Morris III, Bryan Reynolds, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval

4. Submitted by **Lincoln Graduate Center**
 - a. 113- Scope of Work, #ABA 0505-426 7.5 hours
*Thomas Browning, Larry Cole, Michael Deal, Edmond Fisher, Joe Huffman, Raulie Irwin, Jr., Martin Molloy, Joseph Portera, David Shoemaker, Loren Stiner
Recommend approval
 - b. 114- Understanding Fannie Mae's Guidelines, #ABA 0505-427 7.5 hours
*Thomas Browning, Larry Cole, Michael Deal, Edmond Fisher, Joe Huffman, Raulie Irwin, Jr., Martin Molloy, Joseph Portera, David Shoemaker, Loren Stiner
Recommend approval
 - c. 12-1 The Truth about Mold, #ABA 0505-428 7.5 hours
*Thomas Browning, Larry Cole, Michael Deal, Edmond Fisher, Joe Huffman, Raulie Irwin, Jr., Martin Molloy, Joseph Portera, David Shoemaker, Loren Stiner
Recommend approval
 - d. 172- 2006 National USPAP Update, #ABA 0705-466 7 hours
*Daniel Shoemaker, Larry Cole, Edmond Fisher, Michael Deal, Joe Huffman, Martin Molloy, Joseph Portera, David Shoemaker
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by **Trans-American Institute of Professional Studies, Inc.**
 - a. Residential Appraisal Report Forms and USPAP Compliance, #ABA 0805-473 7 hours
*Lynne Heiden, Barry Shea, Ann Susko
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by **American Society of Farm Managers and Rural Appraisers**
 - a. Computer Plotting Legal Descriptions for the Layman, 8 hours
*Mike Johnson
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by **The Columbia Institute**
 - a. Survey of the Cost Approach, No. 106, 8 hours
*Marc Abood, Bernard Boarnet, Bobby Crisp, George Harrison, Dr., Samuel Henderson, Robert Hetrick, Howard Johnson, Amelia, Lovern-Brown, Marty Molley, Roy Morris III, Bryan Reynolds, Daniel Smith, Diana Jacobs
Recommend approval
3. Submitted by **McKissock Appraisal School**
 - a. Mortgage Fraud-Protect Yourself!, 7 hours
*Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
 - b. Scope of Work, 7 hours
*Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval

- c. The Cost Approach, 7 hours
*Ken Guilfoyle
Recommend approval
- 4. Submitted by **Trans-American Institute of Professional Studies, Inc.**
 - a. Appraising in the Foreclosure Market, 7 hours
*Lynne Heiden, Barry Shea, Ann Susko
Recommend approval